Burnout & Resilience in the Medical Community

An Evidence-Based Discussion

Maine Academy of Pediatrics May 2, 2015

Joe (George) Dreher, MD, MMC Medical Education







Tonight's playing field ...

- Mid Coast Hospital has its own history, culture, resources and challenges.
- Everything in health care seems to be a moving target except the need to provide good care.
- Emerging range of solutions allow a dynamic menu of multifaceted approaches for all members of the team and the team itself.

Resilience

The ability to adapt in healthy ways to adversity
 An ongoing process of interacting with life challenges

Contributing factors:

- Caring and supportive mutual relationships
- Communication skills
- Experience / self-confidence
- Emotional self-regulation
- Realistic goal implementation
- Self-compassion

Interacting dimensions of resilience

- 1. Individual / personal (& their outside supports)
- 2. Localized teams / systems
- 3. Greater organizational system
- Awareness and constructive actions promoted within each of these and all collaborating over time has been proven to be most effective.



Beginning with the individual provider ...

Work life 2015 ...



Our psychological strengths

- Thoroughness
- Commitment
- Doing everything "right"
- Healthy skepticism
- Altruism, stoicism, hard work
- Caring
- Rationality
- Self-criticism

Our psychological vulnerabilities

=>

- Over-compulsiveness
- Over-commitment
- Inability to admit mistakes
- Need for certainty
- Neglecting self-care and family
- Compassion fatigue
- Emotional distance
- Self-deprecation

Work drains escalating...

- Long hours
- Many meetings
- Constant interruptions
- Deadline pressures



- Productivity expectations higher yet static resources
- Tedious tasks (especially with EHR) ("pixels or people?")
- Rapidly changing health care system
- Less autonomy & increasing expectations
- Silo work environment / peer disconnection
- Uncertainty / insecurity



These factors interact => Stress



- Excessive stress => excessive / prolonged cortisol release => increased body-wide inflammation which:
 - Damages blood vessels & B/P increased
 - Damages Central Nervous System cells
 - Reduces Insulin response => promotes diabetes
 - Promotes joint diseases
 - More risk for common cold / weight gain / slowed wound healing / sleep dysfunction / heart disease / depression / peptic ulcers / multiple GI disorders / escalates MS pain / medically unexplained symptoms ...
 - □ ~ 30% of work-related illness from stress (Inter.Labor Org.)

Stress associated health issues

Stress related weight gain due to:

- Burning off less calories => 11 # weight gain/ yr.
- $\sim 40\%$ will increase food intake => conditioned overeating
- Stimulates preference for sugar/fat/starchy food => mood & energy swings
- Increased insulin level & less fat oxidation => more fat storage (especially abdominal fat) Lilian Cheung, D.Sc., RD / Kiecolt-Glaser Biol Psychiatry 2013
- Aetna found
 - □ \$2,000/yr. in health costs related to varying stress levels
 - \$3,000/yr. more productivity resulting from their in-house wellness program (Huffington Post 9.23.14)
- More distractibility / self-centered thinking / decreased decision making ability / concrete thinking => Behavioral Ruts

Chronic Stress => Behavioral Ruts

Too much stress / unrealistic expectations =>

providers fall into automatic / default routines rather than flexibly responding =>

responses less corrective =>

more rigid / less aligned with own values =>

more stress => etc. etc. ...

Angier Brain as Co-conspirator in Vicious Stress Loop NYT 8.2009

Anxiety-Performance Response Curve



All these promote symptoms of **Burnout**

Emotional exhaustion

Emotionally overextended and exhausted by work / unable to recover during time off

Depersonalization

Negative, cynical attitude, treating others / patients as objects => blame & complain

Sense of low personal accomplishment

 Feelings of incompetence, inefficiency and inadequacy / reduced sense of accomplishment / diminished hope

Burnout by Medical Specialty 2011

- 7288 physicians and 3442 working U.S. adults compared using Maslach Burnout Inventory
 - Overall 45.8% of physicians reported at least one of the three symptoms of burnout
- Compared to High School graduates the Odds Ratio for Burn-Out in higher education gaps was:
 - Bachelor's degreeOR = 0.80P = 0.48Master's degreeOR = 0.71P = .01PhD / professional degreeOR = 0.64P = .04MD or DO degreeOR = 1.36P < .001
- Highest rates amongst those in front lines of care
 - Emergency Medicine ~ 65%
 - Gen. Int. Med. ~ 56%
 - Neurology ~ 55%
 - Family Medicine ~ 54%

Gender Differences in Burnout?

- Females tend to follow pattern of Exhaustion => Cynicism => Reduced confidence and/or sense of accomplishment
- Males tend to start with Cynicism then => Emotional exhaustion BUT less of a move into Self-doubt / reduced sense of accomplishment => less aware of / denial of distress

(& less likely to ask for help & have greater negative impact on co-workers?)

Houkes, I Development of Burnout over Time BMC Public Health 2011; 11:240

Multiple Risk Factors for Burnout

- Reduced self-care
- Overwork / under sleep
- Low control / high responsibility
- Reduced self-awareness
- Limited support / relationships with others
- Difficult communications
- Inability to live up to one's own standards
 - "Imposter syndrome" / not being enough / perfectionism
- Feeling of depression / grief / guilt in response to losses
- Erosion of values / meaning in work
- Imbalance between personal & professional life



Burnout Health Risks

- Increased physical problems (prior slide)
- Increased mental health problems (prior slide)
- Increased risk of chemical misuse
- Reduction of meaning in work
 - reduced commitment & engagement
- Increasing sense of guilt / unworthiness
- Loss of direction / purpose
- Increased home conflicts

Shanafelt CMA Physician Health conference 2012 Center JAMA 289:3;161 2003

Individual's Burnout impacts others

- Less present / available to others/patients
 - Reduced satisfaction of contacts
 - Reduced adherence by / engagement with others
- Prone to reflexive, rigid & reactive responses
- More emotionally exhausted => reduction in available knowledge base
- Stressed => impaired skills & reasoning

Med Care 23:85, Health Psych 12:93, JGIM 15:122 JAMA 306:952, J Mental Nervous IDs 202: 353 Shanafelt CMA Physician Health conference 2012

Individual => Organizational Burnout

- Morale diminished / clashes increase
 - Disruptions = 47% physician source / 48% nurse & physician source
- Less creativity / flexibility / slower response to change
- Increased errors / omissions
- More malpractice suits
- Work ethic & productivity decreased / "presenteeism"
- Drives away providers / earlier retirement / disability 2' to illness
- Attrition rates increase => costly new hires, training and rampup time (for any team member)

2009 Doctor-Nurse Behavior Study *American College of Physician Executives* Bodenheimer, T From Triple to Quadruple Aim *Ann Fm Med* 12;6:573

Resistance to change

"People are much more resistant to being changed by others than they are to change itself."

Dennis Wagner, MPA, Co-Director of the Partnership for Patients Initiative and consultant in Q. I. efforts with the CMS Innovation Center at Hanley Center Forum November 2014

"Doing to" rather than "Doing with" ...

Mental Rat Race ...



Engaged & Rewarding work



A Core Awareness ...

Self-love, my liege, is not so vile a sin as self-neglect.

Henry V, Act 2, scene 4

Responses to challenges at any level

Unhealthy reactions (reflex reacting)

Unskillful behaviors we "can't keep from doing"

"Survival skills" (habits)

 Help us get through a tough time, but eventually destructive if primary / chronic (especially if proud of these => culture of endurance)

Growth; healthy coping and changing (flexible response)

- Requires active cultivation in self and workplace
- Maintains homeostasis = promotes resilience

Actions to prevent individual burnout

Individual resilience practices

- Speak up before burned-out / asking for help when needed
- Meaningful leisure time activities / scheduled work time-outs
- Exercise
- Contact with colleagues / find a mentor
- Cultivation of relationships with family and friends
- Acknowledgement of uncertainty / use errors to learn
- Clear personal boundaries
- Building professionalism (self-education/teaching)
- Self-organization
- Personal reflection / awareness / meditation / relaxation techniques
- Spiritual practices

Zwack, J Resilience Strategies of Experienced Physicians *Acad. Med.* 88: 382 Physician Burnout: Preparing for a Perfect Storm StuderGroup C-suite bulletin Feb 2012 Training in (+) outlook improves function /counters culture of (-) anxiety

Exercise (Babyck et al 2007)

Meditation (Dweck, 2007)

Journaling (Slater & Peenebaker 20006)

Random Acts of Kindness (Lyubonoursky 2005)

Seeking 3 New Gratitudes per day *(Emmons & McCullough 2003)

TED.com – Shawn Achor - Creating positive change

Mindful Practice

(one individual resource)



Moment-to-moment purposeful attentiveness to one's own mental processes during everyday activities with the goal of practicing with clarity and compassion

Mindfulness Impact on Working in a High-Stress Environment

- 3 groups of HR personnel tested on completing complex tasks in a very distracting/multitasking environment then:
 - Gp1) completed 8 week MBSR course then tested again
 - Gp 2) wait listed, then re-tested, then completed 8 week MBSR course and retested for a third time
 - Gp 3) 8 week body relaxation training then retested
- Only those trained in MBSR:
 - Had increased daily mindfulness and attention to environment
 - Stayed on assigned tasks longer / made fewer task switches
 - Had less negative emotions/fatigue-inertia after task completion
 - Improved memory for tasks performed (as did "relaxers")
 Levy, D M et al The Effects of Mindfulness Meditation Training on Multitasking in a High-Stress Information Environment Proceedings of Graphics Interface (GI 2012)

Mindful Communication: Bringing Intention, Attention, and Reflection into Clinical Practice

Krasner, et al. Association of an educational program in mindful communication with burnout, empathy, and attitudes in primary care physicians. *JAMA* 2009, 302(12): 1284-1293.

Group of long-term physicians from across primary specialties completing a program on Mindful Practice and then monitored over the following 10 months

Changes in well-being

Burnout:

Emotional Exhaustion	r= 0.62	p<.001
 Depersonalization 	r= 0.45	p<.001
 Personal Accomplishment 	r= 0.44	p<.001
Mood:		
Total Mood Disturbance	r= 0.69	p<.001
- Depression		
Depression	r= 0.55	p<.001
DepressionAnger	r= 0.55 r= 0.76	p<.001 p<.001

- Similar results in other studies
 - Amutio, A Enhancing relaxation states and positive emotion in physicians through a mindfulness training program: A one year study *Psych, Health & Med.* Nov 2014

Attitudes/collaborations to prevent individual burnout

Individual useful attitudes

- Realism & acceptance
- Self-awareness / evaluation of life experience
- Recognizing when change is necessary
- Appreciate the good things / gratitude
- Workplace related collaborative programs
 - Gratification in personal interactions
 - Gratification in professional mastery & meaning
 - Autonomy to improve the downsides of job

Zwack, J Resilience Strategies of Experienced Physicians *Acad. Med.* 88: 382 Physician Burnout: Preparing for a Perfect Storm StuderGroup C-suite bulletin Feb 2012
United you / we stand

- One should not be in isolation
 - Have a trusted colleague or two along
 - Be mentored / mentor others
 - Be involved in team efforts
 - Find/build a "connection place" = time with peers
 - Maintain personal support systems
 - formal (support groups/therapy)
 - informal (life partner / family / community volunteer ...)

Hierarchy of Provider's work allegiances ?

- 1. To their Profession
- 2. To their Patients
- 3. To their Health Care Team
- If they feel they are not given resources to provide good patient care, their workplace engagement diminishes.
- Work to reframe away from cynicism to "What can we do to improve patient care?"

Dennis Wagner, MPA, Co-Director of the Partnership for Patients Initiative and consultant in Q. I efforts with the CMS Innovation Center at Hanley Center Forum November 2014

Three Keys for employee satisfaction: Autonomy

- Promotes creative & self-driven work often better than pure \$ rewards
- Desire autonomy over:
 - Task (what they do)
 - Time (when they do it)
 - Team (Who they do it with)
 - Technique (how they do it)

Pink, D Drive 2013

Three Keys for employee satisfaction: Mastery

- Promote "flow" = challenges matched to abilities
- Promote providers abilities as improvable
- Acceptance of this as continual journey rather than set goal = requires "grit"
- Opportunities for focused effort/practice
- A mover from compliance towards engagement

Pink, D Drive 2013

Three Keys for employee satisfaction: Purpose / Values

- Profit/margin as mutually supporting purpose maximization:
 - Goal of using profit to support purpose
 - Goals/mission/actions which go beyond organizations self-interest
 - Policies which allow providers to pursue their sense of purpose in daily work

Some specific administration options

- Understand provider drive to provide the best care to their patients
- Awareness of signs & symptoms of burnout
 - Clear message you desire to prevent / tx it
 - Encourage wellness efforts
 - Encourage going to peer educational conferences
 - At least 20% of their work time is on something particularly meaningful to them
 - Intervene when provider exhibits sx
 - Promote civility & collegiality

Physician Burnout: Preparing for a Perfect Storm StuderGroup C-suite bulletin Feb 2012

More specific administration options

- Measure and act on satisfaction /engagement indices one domain at a time
- Stay in touch (making provider/staff rounds)
- Reward & recognize
- Training staff in:
 - Efficient/clear communication
 - Conflict resolution
- Reconnect providers to passion for work

Physician Burnout: Preparing for a Perfect Storm StuderGroup C-suite bulletin Feb 2012

High Functioning Primary Care Practices

- Site visits to 23 high-performing primary care practices nation-wide evaluating distribution of functions amongst the team, using technology to their advantage, improve outcomes with data, and made the job of primary care feasible and enjoyable"
- Major findings included:
 - Proactive planning of care
 - Expanded sharing of clinical care more among tem members
 - Expanded sharing clinical tasks among team members
 - Improved timely communication via voice-mail & in-box management
 - Improved team functionality through co-location, meetings and work flow mapping

"Manage Your Energy, Not Your Time"

- Trialed in financial /automotive/electronics firms
- Programs of mutually reinforcing personal training:
 - Physical / Nutritional
 - Emotional Energy
 - Mental Energy
 - Spiritual Energy
- Plus organizational support of these efforts
- Participants compared to controls over the next year had:
 - Revenues increased 13 to 20 %
 - Relationships with clients improved in 68%
 - Better focused on and aware of what is important in their work (& lives)

Schwartz T & McCarthy C Manage Your Energy, Not Your Time Harvard Bus. Rev. Oct 2007

Collaborative workplace options

- Leadership support (Mindful Leadership course)
- Leaders modeling self-care (Go home on time / no 2 am e-mails ...)
- Reducing tedium / metrics & EHR frustrations (Scribes)
- Training in interpersonal competency (communication / conflict resolution)
- Peer connection/counseling/coaching & mentoring
 - New hire orientation & support
 - Focused support for those in crisis
 - Ongoing support / assistance as needed by any provider
- Collaborative problem solving
- **Resilience training** (Yoga, Balient Gp., MBSR, (+) Psych training ...)
- **Team & Techno-work** (Sinsky Finding the Joy In Practice Ann Fm Med 2013)
- Ongoing evaluation and innovation

(Dunn P M Meeting the Imperative to Improve Physician Well-Being J Gen Intern Med 2007)

Workplace examples

- Brigham & Women's Hospital Peer-to-Peer Support
- Cleveland Clinic Coaching & Mentorship program
- Oxford Radcliff Hospitals two year Resilience and Occupational Health program for all new attendings.
- South Australia primary care based check-up program to evaluate well-being & provide prevention care => malpractice insurance discounts.
- On-site gym / yoga / mindfulness classes
- Mayo Clinic Balient / cross-professions support groups
- MMC Medical Staff Peer Support program

Upcoming Maine Health Seminars

Peer-To-Peer Support - May 18 & 19, 2015

- Jo Shapiro, MD from Brigham & Women's will be training those who wish to be Peer support volunteers within their system.
- Second session will offer nuts & bolts advice from MMC staff on building medical & nursing Peer To Peer support programs.
- Professionalism May 18, 2015
 - Separate seminar by Jo Shapiro on Building a Culture of Professionalism within your system

Shapiro, J Instituting a Culture of Professionalism *Joint Comm. J on Quality & Patient Safety* April 2014;40 P168

US \Leftrightarrow THEM

What generates it? How to approach / unravel this perception / belief / experience ?



Seek those who are resilient

- What persons / what organization do I know who are resilient?
- Find out what makes them so.
- Repeat until you find a menu of items which work for you / in your organization.
- Incorporate them one at a time

Vocation

Vocation does not mean a goal that I pursue. It means a calling that I hear.

Before I can tell my life what I want to do with it, I must listen to my life telling me who I am.

I must listen for the truths and values at the heart of my own identity, not the standards by which I must live, but the standards by which I cannot help but live if I am living my own life.

Be well